

# CHAPTER 8 | Evaluation of the Previous Housing Element

## 8.1 Accomplishments under the Fifth Cycle Housing Element

[State housing element law requires that local governments review the effectiveness of the housing element goals, policies, and related actions to meet the community's housing needs, including those with special housing needs \(Government Code Section 65588\). The following is a summary of the City's major accomplishments during the Fifth Cycle described in Table 8-2, and highlights progress toward meeting special housing needs in Clovis, where applicable:](#)

- **RHN Overlay Zone.** In 2018, the City adopted a Regional Housing Needs (RHN) Overlay zone and City staff marketed the program to affordable housing developers.
- **New Permanent Supportive Housing** The RHN Overlay has resulted in Butterfly Gardens, a 75-unit permanent supportive housing project that completed construction in 2022. Butterfly Gardens provides housing and social services for vulnerable residents, including individuals with disabilities and at risk of homelessness.
- **New Affordable Housing Production.** In 2021 the Fresno Housing Authority completed a 60-unit affordable housing complex called Solvita Commons, located on West Alluvial Avenue in the northern part of the city. [The complex includes units accessible to people with disabilities. The City provided financial subsidies to other affordable housing developments that provide housing for seniors and people living with disabilities including a 48-unit assisted living complex \(Magnolia Crossing\) with 24 of those units restricted for low-income seniors, as well as Butterfly Gardens. Affordable housing units also support the housing needs of the City's single-parent households.](#)
- **Affordable Housing Fee Reduction Program.** In 2019 the City Council adopted the Affordable Housing Development Impact Fee Reduction Program with an initial funding of \$1 million to assist in the payment of impact fees for affordable housing developments. In 2020 the City allocated \$1 million to the Fresno Housing Authority for the 60-unit affordable housing development called Solvita Commons. In 2021, the City granted \$300,000 through this program to support the construction of Butterfly Gardens, a 75-unit permanent supportive housing development. The City also committed PHLA funds to the Jefferson multi-family project, an affordable 59-unit project that is seeking funds from the State for construction.
- **Streamlining Multi-family Housing Approvals.** In 2019, the City amended its Development Code to specify that all multi-family projects and the multi-family portion of mixed use projects are processed as "Multifamily Residential Development Review" (MFRDR) applications, which are ministerial, exempt from CEQA, and only appealable by applicants.
- **Cottage Home Program and Accessory Dwelling Units.** Clovis has a Cottage Home Program to encourage infill residential development of 400-square foot accessory dwelling units that have alley access. The City funded the cost of preparing and approving three sets of building plans that can be used for free by anyone participating in the program. In addition, the City has seen an increase in the number of accessory dwelling units (ADUs) since 2018 when the City updated its ADU ordinance consistent with State law. In 2021, the City permitted a total of 23 ADUs (not including any Junior ADUs which might have gone untracked). [ADUs and cottage homes continue to provide a source of affordable housing to seniors, as well as support senior homeowners aging in place by providing an opportunity to supplement their income or house caretakers.](#)

## Evaluation of the Previous Housing Element

- **Home Repair and Mobile Home Replacement Grants.** Staff completed ~~323~~<sup>25</sup> home repair grants and 15 replacements of dilapidated mobile homes during the planning period, many of which provided support to seniors, people with disabilities, and others living on fixed incomes who have difficulty keeping up with home repair and maintenance needs. ~~in 2021, expending approximately \$140,000 in CDBG funds for the program.~~ In 2020, HCD released a CalHome Program NOFA, and the City submitted an application for \$5,000,000, ~~this which~~ was awarded to the City in 2021 and is being expended. In 2021, the City completed 25 home repair grants, expending approximately \$140,000 in Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) funds for the program. The City recently submitted a CalHome Program application for an additional \$5,000,000 in response to the 2023 NOFA.
- **Facilitating Annexation.** On June 4, 2018, City Council Resolution 18-76 was adopted approving an amendment to the Tax Sharing Agreement to permit annexation of land for the purpose of RHNA. The County Board of Supervisors approved the amendment
- **Annexation of Land for Housing.** The City annexed land to expand capacity for housing, including Site PA-3 (20.9 acres of HDR - 418 unit capacity) annexed in 2016, and Site PA-1 (13.3 acres MU-V - 266 unit capacity) and PA-2 (18 acres of HDR - 360 unit capacity) annexed in 2019.
- **Development Code Amendments:** On August 6, 2018, the City adopted Development Code amendments that include a procedure to allow reasonable accommodations for people with disabilities and provisions for farmworker housing and single-room occupancy units. Although the City allows farmworker housing consistent with the requirements of State law, the City received no proposals for farmworker housing during the planning period.

## 8.18.2 Progress Toward Meeting the RHNA

The City issued 8,990 total building permits issued for housing units from the start of the fifth cycle planning period (2015) through the end of 2022. Of the total building permits issued for housing units, 59 percent were for above moderate-income housing, 39 percent were for moderate-income housing, and 2 percent were for low- or very low-income housing. It should be noted that two affordable housing developments built in the City provided very low- and extremely low-income units (Solvita Commons and Butterfly Gardens). However, because the affordability of the units was unknown at the time of building permits being issued, these units are counted as low-income units in the APR.

As shown in Table 8-1, the City has permitted more than double the number of units needed to meet the above moderate-income RHNA, triple the number of units needed to meet the moderate-income RHNA, but has not issued sufficient permits to meet the lower-income housing need.

Income Level	RHNA Allocation	Number of Units Permitted as of 2022	Percentage of RHNA met
Very Low	2,321	7	0.3%
Low	1,145	167	15%
Moderate	1,018	3,542	348%
Above Moderate	1,844	5,274	286%
<b>Total</b>	<b>6,328</b>	<b>8,990</b>	<b>78%</b>

Source: City of Clovis 2022 Annual Progress Report.

## **8.28.3 ~~Programs to Address Special Housing Needs~~ Program Evaluation**

The following section reviews and evaluates the City's progress in implementing programs from the previous planning period. As part of analyzing prior programs, s~~State~~ housing element law requires that local governments review the cumulative effectiveness of the housing element goals, policies, and related actions to meet the community's special housing needs (Government Code Section 65588). Table 8-2 summarizes progress on the implementation programs from the previous Housing element, including programs to address special needs populations summarized below. As shown in Table 8-2, the 2015-2023 Housing Element included programs addressing reasonable accommodations for persons with disabilities and affordable housing, including Programs 6, 7, 9, 11, and 13 through 20. he City is working on improving and maintaining its building codes to meet accessibility requirements as well as advancing the creation of affordable housing. The City has provided subsidies to affordable housing developments, including a 75-unit permanent supportive housing development (Butterfly Gardens) constructed in 2022, as well as construction of new single-family homes by Habitat for Humanity for low-income households, including veteran households. Fair Housing printed materials are available in both English and Spanish to increase accessibility.

### **Seniors and Persons with Disabilities**

As discussed in Chapter 3, nearly 50 percent of the City's senior households are considered lower-income households. Seniors and persons with disabilities are especially likely to live on fixed incomes and require accessibility modifications to homes to support mobility and independent living. A significant portion of the City's housing stock was built prior to the passage of the Americans with Disability Act (ADA) in 1990. Rehabilitation and physical improvements are important to ensure that housing is accessible to older populations and people with disabilities.

The City continues to work on improving and maintaining its building codes to meet accessibility requirements as well as advancing the creation of affordable housing. As described in Chapter 4, the City secured federal and state grant funding to continue administering a Housing Rehabilitation Program (Program 14) that provided grants to complete 323 home repairs and replacement of 15 dilapidated mobile homes that house extremely low-income seniors at high risk of homelessness. The City has been awarded additional federal and state funding to continue and expand this program, as well as \$1,337,500 in CDBG funds to complete necessary ADA accessibility improvements on public facilities in Clovis's older neighborhoods.

Although new construction fell short of the City's 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle RHNA, especially in the lower-income categories, the City provided financial support to several affordable housing developments that provide accessible housing for seniors and people with disabilities (Program 7), including a 75-unit permanent supportive housing development (Butterfly Garden) constructed in 2022 and a 48-unit assisted living complex (Magnolia Gardens) with half of the units deed-restricted to low-income seniors. The City also provided financial support to Solvita Commons, a 60-unit affordable housing development with units accessible to people with disabilities.

### **Large Households**

Homes consisting of five or more members residing together typically lack adequately sized and affordable housing options. Approximately 14.3 percent of all households in Clovis are large households with five or more members, as of 2020. Most large households are owner-occupied households (69.2 percent). The most critical housing need of large households is access to larger housing units with more bedrooms than a standard three-bedroom dwelling. As discussed in Chapter 3, Clovis has an adequate supply of units with four or more bedrooms for large households that are able to purchase a home. Among affordable housing units built during the 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle, 31 units included three or more bedrooms.

### **Single-Parent Households (Female-Headed)**

As discussed in Chapter 3, many single parent households, especially female-headed households, have a greater risk of poverty due to higher family expenses and single-wage incomes. Given the availability of jobs, transit, housing, educational facilities and other services, Clovis has a greater presence of single female-headed households than other area in the county, with the exception of the City of Fresno. Single-parent households can benefit from most

## Evaluation of the Previous Housing Element

[affordable housing programs, including Housing Choice Vouchers \(Program 19\), Homebuyer Assistance Program \(Program 16\), and Housing Rehabilitation Program \(Program 14\). Between 2015 and 2021, the City assisted 157 female-headed households through the Housing Rehabilitation Program. The City offers information on these programs on their website and refers individuals when queried, as well as continuing to allocate federal, state, and local funding to support these programs.](#)

### **Farmworkers**

[As described previously in Chapter 3, farmworkers are a significant population to the regional economy but likely represent a relatively small population in the City of Clovis. Although the City received no applications to develop farmworker housing, the City continues to monitor farmworker housing as well as offer incentives and support for farmworker housing \(Program 8\), including streamlined processing and gap financing on their website. Farmworker housing needs are generally accommodated through housing programs and policies that assist lower-income households.](#)

### **People Experiencing or At-Risk of Homelessness**

[Without sufficient protections and affordable housing options, many low-income renters are at risk of experiencing homelessness. The last Point in Time \(PIT\) count, which was done in 2023, estimated 76 individuals experiencing homelessness in the zip code areas of the City of Clovis out of 3,812 people experiencing homelessness in Fresno and Madera Counties. The City collaborates with service agencies dedicated to providing shelter, housing, and case management services to those in need. In addition to coordination at a local level, Clovis has leveraged state and federal grant funding to preserve existing forms of affordable housing and expand the City's stock of affordable units. As described above, the City's Housing Rehabilitation and Mobile Home Replacement Program funded the replacement of 15 dilapidated mobile homes that house extremely low-income seniors who are at high risk of homelessness. The City also provided financial support to a 75-unit permanent supportive housing development \(Butterfly Gardens\) that provides housing to people at-risk of experiencing homelessness. In order to continue and expand upon these efforts, the City has allocated \\$750,000 in CDBG funding over the next five years towards efforts to increase the supply of affordable multi-family units including transitional and permanent housing, support ongoing regional efforts to end chronic homelessness, and improve the quality of existing housing stock.](#)

Table 8-2 Evaluation of 2015-2023 City of Clovis Housing Element Programs			
Program	Target Timeframe	Evaluation	Recommendation
<b>Program 1: Regional Collaboration on Housing Opportunities</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continue to participate in the Countywide Housing Element Technical Committee to collaborate on housing program implementation and regional issues.</li> <li>The Countywide Housing Element Technical Committee will meet at least biannually.</li> <li>The Committee will meet annually with HCD to discuss funding opportunities and challenges in implementation of programs and seek technical assistance.</li> <li>The Committee will meet periodically with Fair Housing of Central California to discuss fair housing issues.</li> <li>The Committee will advocate on behalf of the Fresno region for more grant funding.</li> <li>Continue to seek partnerships with other jurisdictions in the region and other agencies (such as the Housing Authority), housing developers, community stakeholders, and agricultural employers/employees to explore viable options for increasing the availability of farmworker housing.</li> <li>Develop a directory of services and resources for lower-income households.</li> <li>Make the directory available on City/County websites and at City/County offices.</li> </ul>	Ongoing	<p>City Staff normally meets twice annually with all participating jurisdictions to work towards the goals and objectives outlined in the housing element by sharing best practices, exploring opportunities for further collaboration, and making the best use of limited resources.</p> <p>Staff of the participating local governments also met with representatives of HCD to discuss funding opportunities and challenges in implementing their programs.</p> <p>The city posts available affordable housing resources on the city website, and posts affordable housing resources as they become available on the City's social media accounts.</p>	Program was applicable to the Fifth Cycle Housing Element only. Remove program.
<b>Program 2: Review Annexation Standards in Memorandum of Understanding</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The County of Fresno and the cities within the County shall work together to review and revise, as deemed appropriate by all parties, the standards for annexation contained in the Memorandum of Understanding between the County and the cities.</li> </ul>	Ongoing	On June 4, 2018, the City Council adopted an amendment to the Tax Sharing Agreement to permit annexation of land for purpose of RHNA. The County Board of Supervisors also approved the amendment.	Program completed. Remove program.
<b>Program 3: Provision of Adequate Sites</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Maintain and annually update the inventory of residential land resources.</li> <li>Provide the inventory on the City website and make copies available upon request.</li> </ul>	Ongoing	The City monitors development relative to the sites inventory and continues to maintain adequate sites to meet the Fifth Cycle Regional Housing Needs Allocation. The Planning Division maintains an inventory of affordable housing sites within its Geographical Information System.	Modify this program to meet new no net loss requirements.

## Evaluation of the Previous Housing Element

Program	Target Timeframe	Evaluation	Recommendation
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Monitor development and other changes in the inventory to ensure the City has remaining capacity consistent with its share of the regional housing need.</li> <li>Actively participate in the development of the next RHNA Plan to better ensure that the allocations are reflective of the regional and local land use goals and policies.</li> </ul>		The City also participated in the Fresno COG RHNA subcommittee to provide input on the Sixth Cycle Regional Housing Needs Plan and allocation methodology.	
<b>Program 4: Rezoning for RHNA</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Provide adequate zoning on at least 221 acres of land by December 31, 2016, to cover the unaccommodated need from the Fourth Cycle RHNA of 4,425 lower-income units.</li> <li>If annexation of the “prezoned” sites is not completed within three years of adoption of the Housing Element, the City will conduct an analysis to determine if adequate capacity exists on the remaining sites in the inventory to meet the Fifth Cycle RHNA.</li> <li>If the City cannot identify adequate capacity, the City will rezone sites within four years of adoption of the Housing Element to meet the RHNA. The rezoned sites will meet the criteria for lower-income housing described above.</li> </ul>	Completed on December 31, 2016 and April 2019	<p>The City took several actions to meet the Fourth and Fifth Cycle RHNA obligations. In 2018, the City created a new RHN Overlay zone that allows affordable housing at 35-43 units per acre and applied it to over 130 acres to accommodate the Fourth Cycle unaccommodated need. The City added additional RHN Overlay sites to <del>to</del> further expand capacity for lower-income housing. The City marketed the RHN Overlay program and it resulted in Butterfly Gardens, a 75-unit affordable housing project that completed construction in 2022.</p> <p>The City also annexed the prezoned sites that were counted toward the Fifth Cycle RHNA. Specifically, the City annexed Site PA-3 (20.9 acres of HDR - 418 unit capacity) on April 10, 2016, and annexed Site PA-1 (13.3 acres MU-V - 266 unit capacity) and PA-2 (18 acres of HDR - 360 unit capacity) on January 28, 2019.</p>	Program completed. Replace with strategy to meet the Sixth Cycle RHNA.
<b>Program 5: Monitoring of Residential Capacity (No Net Loss)</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Develop and implement a formal evaluation procedure pursuant to Government Code Section 65863 by 2016.</li> <li>Monitor and report through the HCD annual report process.</li> </ul>	2016/ Annual	The Planning Division maintains an inventory of affordable housing sites within its Geographical Information System. The identification of housing inventory sites has been added to the application forms for all types of development activity, triggering the need to conduct the no-net-loss analysis for applicable projects. The Planning Division has procedures to conduct the no-net-loss analysis when development other than what is shown in the housing sites inventory is proposed and/or approved. The procedures are posted on the City's Affordable Housing website.	Combine program with Program 3.

Table 8-2 Evaluation of 2015-2023 City of Clovis Housing Element Programs			
Program	Target Timeframe	Evaluation	Recommendation
<b>Program 6: Water and Wastewater Service</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continue to monitor water and wastewater capacity and make improvements, as appropriate and feasible, to better serve existing development and strive to accommodate the RHNA.</li> <li>Establish procedures by the end of 2016 for granting priority water and sewer service to developments with lower-income units in compliance with California Government Code Section 65589.7.</li> </ul>	Ongoing	<p>The water, wastewater, and recycled water masterplans were adopted in July 2018. These plans work in concert with each other to enhance available supply and provide full service to the plan area as systematic growth occurs.</p> <p>The City Council adopted policy language on March 18, 2019 to provide priority water and sewer service for lower-income housing in compliance with Government Code Section 65589.7.</p>	Remove program and add a policy to continue to monitor water and wastewater capacity.
<b>Program 7: Affordable Housing Incentives</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continue to seek partnerships and regularly meet, at least annually, with other agencies (such as the Housing Authority), housing developers, community stakeholders, and employers to discuss and pursue viable opportunities for providing affordable housing.</li> <li>Continue to offer incentives such as gap financing, density bonus, streamlined processing (such as pre-application consultation to identify potential issues early on and concurrent processing of required permits to the extent feasible) to facilitate the development of affordable housing, with an emphasis on housing opportunities for very low and extremely low income households, as well as special needs populations, such as the elderly, disabled (including developmentally disabled), farmworkers, the homeless, and those at risk of becoming homeless.</li> <li>Continue to streamline the environmental review process for housing developments to the extent possible, using available State categorical exemptions and Federal categorical exclusions, when applicable.</li> <li>Annually pursue State, Federal, and other funding opportunities to increase the supply of safe, decent, affordable housing in Clovis for lower income households (including extremely low income households), such as seniors, disabled (including persons with developmental disabilities), farmworkers, the homeless, and those at risk of homelessness.</li> <li>Expand the City's affordable housing inventory by 700 units over the next eight years – 160 extremely low income, 240 very low income, and 300 low income units.</li> </ul>	Ongoing	<p>During the planning period, the City provided support in the form of funding, fee reductions, or land donation for the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>48-unit senior assisted living facility with 24 units restricted to low-income seniors (Magnolia Crossing);</li> <li>60-unit lower-income affordable housing development by the Fresno Housing Authority (Solvita Commons),</li> <li>75-unit permanent supportive housing development (Butterfly Gardens), and</li> <li>13 single-family homes for lower-income households built by Habitat for Humanity (Rialto Ranchos subdivision and Stanford Addition Infill).</li> </ul> <p>In 2019 the City Council adopted the Affordable Housing Development Impact Fee Reduction Program with an initial funding of \$1,000,000, and subsequently an additional \$300,000. In 2020, a \$1,000,000 funding request through the program from the Fresno Housing Authority was approved for construction of a 60-unit affordable housing complex (Solvita Commons). Building permits were issued in 2020 and construction completed in 2021. In Spring 2021, \$300,000 was approved for the construction of a 75-unit supportive housing project, Butterfly Gardens, being developed by UpHoldings. The project completed construction in 2022.</p> <p>In 2021 the City applied for, was awarded, and committed \$1.2 million in <del>PHLA</del> PLHA funds to the Jefferson multi-family project, an affordable 50-unit project that is currently seeking funds from the State for construction. <a href="#">The City received an additional</a></p>	Continue program to expand affordable housing development opportunities.



## Evaluation of the Previous Housing Element

Table 8-2 Evaluation of 2015-2023 City of Clovis Housing Element Programs			
Program	Target Timeframe	Evaluation	Recommendation
		<a href="#">\$1,559,243 in PHLA funds between 2022 and 2023 to commit to affordable housing development.</a>  In 2019, the City amended its Development Code to specify that all multi-family projects and the multi-family portion of mixed use projects are processed as "Multifamily Residential Development Review" (MFRDR) applications, which are ministerial, exempt from CEQA, and only appealable by applicants.	
<b>Program 8: Farmworker Housing</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continue to support and encourage other agencies and housing developers, such as the Fresno Housing Authority and Self-Help Enterprises, in the application of funds for farmworker housing, including State HCD and USDA Rural Development loans and grants and other funding sources that may become available.</li> <li>Continue to offer incentives such as gap financing, density bonus, streamlined processing to facilitate the development of farmworker housing.</li> <li>Annually monitor the status of farmworker housing as part of the City's annual report to HCD on Housing Element progress and evaluate if City efforts are effective in facilitating the provision of farmworker housing. If appropriate, make necessary changes to enhance opportunities and incentives for farmworker housing development.</li> </ul>	Ongoing	There were no applications for farmworker housing during the planning period. However, the City makes available on the City of Clovis website information about potential gap financing, density bonus, and streamlined processing.	Continue and modify program to increase outreach and effectiveness.
<b>Program 9: Preserving Assisted Housing</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Monitor the status of any HUD receipt/approval of Notices of Intent and Plans of Action filed by property owners to convert to market rate units.</li> <li>Identify non-profit organizations as potential purchasers/ managers of at-risk housing units.</li> <li>Explore funding sources available to purchase affordability covenants on at-risk projects, transfer ownership of at-risk projects to public or non-profit agencies, purchase existing buildings to replace at-risk units, or construct replacement units.</li> <li>Ensure the tenants are properly noticed and informed of their rights and eligibility to obtain special Section 8 vouchers reserved for tenants of converted HUD properties.</li> </ul>	Ongoing	In October 2021 the City of Clovis received informal notice that an apartment project that was financed with 4 percent bonds is intending to increase rents as it has fulfilled its obligations to the state bond program. Staff has been working with the owner and the Fresno County Housing Authority to address the affordability needs for the impacted families. However, rents have now increased as of January 2023 but are still below market rates.	Continue program to preserve assisted housing units. Expand program to specifically address at-risk developments.



Table 8-2 Evaluation of 2015-2023 City of Clovis Housing Element Programs			
Program	Target Timeframe	Evaluation	Recommendation
<b>Program 10: Encourage and Facilitate Accessory Units (Second Units)</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>By 2018, consider fee reductions for second units.</li> <li>By 2019, implement a public education program advertising the opportunity for second units through the city website and at the planning counter.</li> </ul>	2018 & 2019	<p>Clovis has a Cottage Home Program to encourage infill residential development of 500-square foot accessory dwelling units (ADUs) that have alley access. The City has funded the cost of preparing and approving three sets of building plans which can be used for free by anyone participating in the program. In addition, school fees are exempted for the cottage homes and there is no requirement for separate utilities. The City is advertising the Cottage Home Program on the City website, social media, and direct mail with much success.</p> <p>The City has also adopted an ADU ordinance consistent with state law and offers reduced fees.</p>	Modify program and set new target goal for program
<b>Program 11: Zoning Code Amendments</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Amend Zoning Code to address State law requirements within one year of Housing Element adoption.</li> <li>Review residential parking standards for studio and one-bedroom multi-family units and take action by 2017 to modify the requirements based on the findings of the review.</li> <li>Annually review the effectiveness and appropriateness of the Zoning Code and process any necessary amendments to remove or mitigate potential constraints to the development of housing.</li> </ul>	2017/ Annually	<p>The City Council adopted Development Code amendments on August 6, 2018. The ordinance amendment addressed all the requirements of this program including updates to address farmworker/employee housing, reasonable accommodation, definition of family, single room occupancy units, and removing guest parking requirements for multi-family housing.</p> <p>Urgency Ordinance 19-21 was adopted by the City Council on December 1, 2019, to incorporate changes in State law brought about by the Housing Crisis Act of 2019. Urgency Ordinance 19-21 was extended for one year on December 7, 2020, to allow the City's municipal code to continue to be in conformance with State Housing Laws. The language in the Urgency Ordinance, together with any additional changes brought about by new State housing laws, was permanently adopted through a traditional ordinance amendment process on October 18, 2021.</p>	Modify program to reflect new state law requirements.
<b>Program 12: Lot Consolidation and Lot Splits</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Assist interested developers/property owners in identifying opportunities for lot consolidation or lot splitting.</li> <li>Process requests for lot consolidation and lot splitting concurrent with other development reviews.</li> <li>Encourage the use of master plans/specific plans to provide a cohesive development strategy for large lots.</li> </ul>	Ongoing	<p>Planning staff makes recommendations to the development community on opportunities to further develop parcels/lots to the maximum density allowed for best and maximum use of properties within the city. In 2020, the Development Code was amended to establish a ministerial process to subdivide parcels that qualify for development pursuant to the Regional Housing Needs (RHN) Overlay District.</p>	Continue program.

## Evaluation of the Previous Housing Element

Table 8-2 Evaluation of 2015-2023 City of Clovis Housing Element Programs			
Program	Target Timeframe	Evaluation	Recommendation
		City Housing staff works with potential developers on identifying opportunity sites that may require lot consolidations or divisions. This is done in conjunction with other planning approvals.	
<b>Program 13: Monitoring of Planning and Development Fees</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continue to monitor the various fees charged by the city to ensure they do not unduly constrain housing development.</li> <li>As appropriate, consider incentives such as deferred or reduced fees to facilitate affordable housing development.</li> </ul>	Ongoing	<p>On November 4, 2019, Clovis City Council passed a resolution authorizing the Affordable Housing Development Impact Fee Reduction Program. The program is intended to reduce impact fees for affordable housing projects that provide deed-restricted units to households that make at or below 80% of Area Median Income.</p> <p>On May 7, 2021, Clovis City Council approved a rate adjustment to the Development Impact Fee (DIF) program which included phased-in adjustment of rate increases in the DIF program to help reduce constraints to development.</p>	Continue program.
<b>Program 14: Housing Rehabilitation Program</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continue to apply for <del>CalHOME</del> Calhome funds to maintain the housing rehabilitation program.</li> <li>Promote Home Rehabilitation Program on City website, at public counters, and to income-eligible households identified through the Code Enforcement program.</li> </ul>	Ongoing	<p>The City continues to apply for <del>CalHOME</del> CalHome and CDBG funds to support the housing rehabilitation program. Since 2016, the City has provided 323 home repair grants and replaced 15 dilapidated mobile homes. In 2021, City was awarded \$5 million in <del>CalHOME</del> CalHome funds, which is being used to fund owner-occupied home rehabilitation, mobile home replacement loan program, and acquisition/rehab/resale loan program all for low-income households</p> <p>City staff continues to promote the housing rehabilitation program on the City's website, at public counters, and to low- and moderate-income households identified through code enforcement and is seeking additional grant funding.</p>	Continue program.
<b>Program 15: Code Enforcement</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continue to use code enforcement and substandard abatement processes to bring substandard housing units and residential properties into compliance with city codes.</li> <li>Refer income-eligible households to City of Clovis housing rehabilitation programs for assistance in making the code corrections.</li> <li>Conduct a housing conditions survey by 2020 to assess the extent of housing rehabilitation needs, as resources are available.</li> </ul>	Ongoing /2020	<p>Clovis formed a Code Enforcement Team which uses Staff from the Building Department, Affordable Housing Department, City Manager's Office, Police Department, Fire Department, Public Utilities, and Legal Counsel to work together to bring substandard housing units and residential properties into compliance with City Code and make referrals to City housing rehabilitation programs.</p> <p>The City completed a housing conditions survey in 2019, with a final report produced in the Spring of 2020.</p>	Continue program to advance the code enforcement team to repair substandard housing.

Table 8-2 Evaluation of 2015-2023 City of Clovis Housing Element Programs			
Program	Target Timeframe	Evaluation	Recommendation
<b>Program 16: Homebuyer Assistance Program</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continue to pursue CDBG, HOME, and other funding opportunities annually to maintain the first-time homebuyer assistance program.</li> </ul>	Annually	<p>In 2020 the City received an award of \$1,000,000 for the first time homebuyer program. However, due to the rapid increase in home prices and the very low purchase price limit issued by HUD for the program, the program <del>has not started</del> <u>was stalled from 2020 to 2022</u>. <del>In May 2021, staff requested a waiver from HCD and HUD but has not received a determination that would allow the program to be feasible. Currently, in 2022</del> HUD <del>has</del> put all HOME funded DAP programs on hold statewide.</p>	<p>Modify program to work with HUD and HCD to <del>revise the purchase price limit</del> <u>implement program when authorized by HUD</u>.</p>
<b>Program 17: First-Time Homebuyer Resources</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Prepare promotional materials by 2016 and promote available homebuyer resources on City website and public counters.</li> <li>Annually review funding resources available at the state and federal levels and pursue as appropriate to provide homebuyer assistance.</li> </ul>	2016/ Annually	<p>City Staff continue to seek additional funding from State and Federal resources to provide homebuyer assistance. Because the demand for Clovis' First Time Homebuyer (FTHB) funds far exceeds the amount of funding available, City Staff also refer potential homebuyers to the California Housing Finance Agency's Homebuyer Programs, the Federal Home Loan Bank of San Francisco's, and the Golden State Housing Authority's FTHB programs on a regular basis. Information for all three programs is available on the City of Clovis' affordable housing website. When applications are being accepted for Clovis' FTHB program (as available funding permits), promotional materials for the program are available to the public at Clovis City Hall.</p>	<p>Continue program to annually review and pursue funding. Combine with other first time homebuyer program.</p>
<b>Program 18: Energy Conservation</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Consider incentives to promote green building techniques and features in 2017, and as appropriate adopt incentives by 2018.</li> <li>Continue to promote HERO program by providing a link on the City website and making brochures available at City counters.</li> <li>Continue to promote and support Pacific Gas and Electric Company programs that provide energy efficiency rebates for qualifying energy-efficient upgrades by providing a link on the City website and making brochures available at City counters.</li> <li>Continue to incorporate conservation measures in housing rehabilitation programs.</li> <li>Expedite review and approval of alternative energy devices (e.g., solar panels).</li> </ul>	2017/2018 & Ongoing	<p>The City supports and promotes the HERO program and PG&amp;E programs that support energy conservation. City Staff provide information about these programs to Clovis residents on a regular basis, including referrals to the Fresno Economic Opportunities Commission's (EOC) Weatherization Program for low-income clients needing energy efficiency repairs. City staff print and give or mail potential recipients the applications. Staff also make referrals to Fresno EOC's and Grid Alternative's solar panel program for low-income homeowners. Information regarding all of these programs is also available on the City's website.</p> <p>The City has adopted expedited, streamlined permitting processes for electric vehicle charging stations (2017) and roof top solar energy systems (2015) (Chapter 8.14 and 8.18 of the Clovis Municipal Code).</p>	<p>Continue program to promote and support the HERO program and PG&amp;E programs that support energy conservation.</p>

## Evaluation of the Previous Housing Element

Table 8-2 Evaluation of 2015-2023 City of Clovis Housing Element Programs			
Program	Target Timeframe	Evaluation	Recommendation
<b>Program 19: Housing Choice Vouchers</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Prepare promotional materials by 2016 and provide information on the HCV program on City website and at public counters.</li> <li>Refer interested households to the Fresno Housing Authority and encourage landlords to register their properties with the Housing Authority for accepting HCVs.</li> <li>Work with the Housing Authority to disseminate information on incentives for participating in the HCV program throughout city neighborhoods with varying income levels to promote housing opportunities for all city residents.</li> </ul>	Ongoing	City Staff provide referrals to property owners for HCVP and work regionally to increase funding to all affordable housing agency partners. In 2020, the City partnered with the Fresno Housing Authority on a 60-unit multi-family housing project to increase the supply of affordable housing in Clovis. In addition, in 2021, the Fresno Housing Authority has committed 73 project-based vouchers to a 75-unit permanent supportive housing project in Clovis (Butterfly Gardens) completed in 2022.	Continue program to add promotional materials and expand landlord participation.
<b>Program 20: Fair Housing</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Conduct Fair Housing Assessment as required by HUD on a regular basis (every five years).</li> <li>Work collaboratively with other jurisdictions in the region to provide education to lenders, real estate professionals, and the community at large.</li> <li>Provide information and written materials on fair housing rights, available services, and responsible agencies in English and Spanish. Distribute materials at libraries, community facilities, City offices and public counters, and on the city website by 2016.</li> <li>Refer fair housing complaints to HUD, DEFH, Fair Housing Council of Central California, and other housing agencies, as appropriate.</li> </ul>	Ongoing	On November 4, 2019, Clovis City Council adopted an updated Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice. The City has posted fair housing information on the City's website and continues to distribute information and written materials on fair housing rights. The materials are also available at the public counter. Fair Housing printed materials are available in both English and Spanish. Fair Housing complaints are referred by City staff to the Fair Housing Council of Central California.	Expand program to address new AB 686 fair housing requirements.