

CLOVIS PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES
January 25, 2018

A regular meeting of the Clovis Planning Commission was called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Chair Pro Tem Hatcher in the Clovis Council Chamber.

Flag salute led by Chair Pro Tem Hatcher

Present: Commissioners Antuna, Cunningham, Terrence, Chair Pro Tem Hatcher

Absent: Chair Hinkle

Staff: Bryan Araki, City Planner
Orlando Ramirez, Senior Planner
George Gonzalez, Associate Planner
Sean Smith, Associate Civil Engineer

MINUTES

The Commission approved the December 21, 2017, minutes by a vote of 4-0-1.

COMMISSION SECRETARY

City Planner Bryan Araki informed the Commission that in the next few weeks there would be a public, city-sponsored ceremony for the passing of Harry Armstrong and that the Commission would be kept informed about it.

PLANNING COMMISSION MEMBERS

Commissioner Cunningham disclosed that, on December 22nd, he and Commissioner Antuna were guests of Mr. Leo Wilson and Mr. Dirk Poeschel on a tour of the Leo Wilson product in three different areas. He expressed gratitude for the tour and the interesting discussions, the contents of which will be entered into the record when the relevant products come before the Commission.

COMMUNICATIONS AND REFERRALS

City Planner Araki reported a series of letters connected to Item C of the agenda, along with a memo, that would be covered by staff.

BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

None

CONSENT CALENDAR

None

PUBLIC HEARINGS

- A. Consider Approval Res. 18-01, **TM6208**, A request to approve a 42-Lot vesting tentative tract map on approximately 9.55 acres of property located at the northwest corner of Dakota and Highland Avenues. Mark and Terrilynn Pfaff, David E. Harmon, owners; Stone Valley 6208, LLC, applicant; Ennis Consulting, representative.

City Planner Bryan Araki presented the staff report.

At this point, the Chair opened the floor to the applicant.

Manny Penn of 10326 N. Willow Avenue, Clovis, 93619, gave a brief background statement then offered to answer any questions.

At this point, the Chair opened the floor to those in favor.

Terrilynn Pfaff, requested approval of the project for herself and a neighboring couple (the Harmons), praising Mr. Penn.

Barbara Strachan, speaking for her brother David, requested approval for the project in terms of it completing the development of the area and praising Mr. Penn.

At this point, the Chair opened the floor to those in opposition.

There being none, the Chair closed the public portion.

Commissioner Cunningham remarked that it is refreshing to hear a developer spoken highly of in this particular venue, offering credit to Mr. Penn.

At this point a motion was made by Commissioner Cunningham and seconded by Commissioner Antuna to approve TM6208. The motion was approved by a vote of 4-0-1.

Commissioner Cunningham interjected, with apologies for not bringing it up earlier, the need to update City of Clovis contacts within the project conditions document.

- B. Consider Approval Res. 18-02, **TM6213**, A request to approve a vesting tentative tract map for a 9-lot single-family residential development for property located on the east side of Leonard Avenue, north of Shaw Avenue. Cullen F. & Katherine Dee Rodgers Trs., owners, Century Communities, applicant; Precision Civil Engineering, Inc., representative.

Associate Planner George Gonzalez presented the staff report.

At this point, the Chair opened the floor to the applicant.

Dennis Gabe, 7815 N. Palm Avenue, Fresno, made some remarks and offered to answer questions.

At this point, the Chair opened the floor to those in favor.

There being none, the Chair opened the floor to those in opposition.

There being none, the Chair closed the public portion.

At this point a motion was made by Commissioner Antuna and seconded by Commissioner Hatcher to approve TM6213. The motion was approved by a vote of 4-0-1.

- C. Consider Approval Res. 18-03, **CUP2012-06A**, A request to approve a conditional use permit for modification of an approved 133-unit multiple family residential development for the addition of two-story units for the development located at the southwest corner of Ashlan and Leonard Avenues. Creekside Village, LLC, owner; Ashwood Construction, Inc., applicant/representative.

Senior Planner Orlando Ramirez presented the staff report.

Commissioner Cunningham sought confirmation on whether the requested use and density increase falls within the current zoning for the project area by right. Senior Planner Ramirez confirmed that it would do so, explaining why.

Commissioner Antuna sought clarification on the locations of one-story buildings versus two-story buildings. Senior Planner Ramirez explained where on the site plan the two-story buildings are placed.

At this point the Chair opened the floor to the applicant.

Bree Comstock, President of Ashwood Construction, provided background on the project.

At this point the Chair opened the floor to those in favor.

There being none, the Chair opened the floor to those in opposition.

Richard Milligan, objected to the density increase without additional environmental studies, lack of additional parks for the project area's residents, and questioned the location of additional parking spaces and security. Mr. Milligan requested an additional impact study, the same lighting as in adjacent areas, and a \$1 million property maintenance bond in case the owners of the project go out of business in the near future.

Shey Booth, expressed a desire for security or a masonry wall to protect her children.

Jessica Canonoy, requested more consideration of the project on the basis of potential impacts to the school system, fearing that the local schools cannot support the increased enrollment. She also cited a likely increase in crime due to the increase in population.

Kevin Crane, expressed concern about lighting and an increase in the number of people essentially at his backyard, especially as he also has young children. He stated that having lived in apartment complexes himself, the dense population leads to problems. Mr. Crane also cited objections based on his concern for impacts on the schools, the streets, and security, and requested clarification on whether or not there is a road against his property or not.

Karly Moser, expressed concern for impacts on the school system and her child in particular, citing a school proposed in the master plan at the intersection of Barstow and De Wolf Avenues that was never built before the area was fully developed, questioning where it will be built now. She claimed that she was informed by Reagan Elementary that the school is shipping students to deal with overcrowding, a district-wide issue. Ms. Moser also claimed that, according to crime report websites, apartment complexes of similar dimensions and square footage have much more concentrated crime issues.

Victor Morales, speaking also on behalf of his wife Jacqueline Morales, expressed concern about traffic on Ashlan Avenue, especially during school hours. He asked about what security the complex will have, and whether or not the development will be gated on the Leonard Avenue side, as his children walk on that side of the street.

Commissioner Terrence wished to disclose that he is familiar with Ms. Comstock, has met her on several occasions, yet hasn't seen or talked with her for several months or had any conversations with her regarding this or any pending project.

At this point, the Chair Pro Tem re-opened the floor to the applicant.

Ms. Comstock first pointed out that the project falls within traffic and school limitations already set forth in the general plan. She detailed where masonry block walls and decorative wrought iron fencing will be constructed. She next pointed out that additional parking in accordance with City standards was added, as well as facilities such as a community building and pool being planned for the residents. Ms. Comstock also explained that her company has talented management staff to provide security, maintenance, and on-site property management. She assured that lighting would comply with City standards, and that she would address any other questions.

Commissioner Cunningham sought clarification on the target demographic for this project. Ms. Comstock responded that, although there isn't a specific target demographic, the location being near an educational facility would bring in families, as is the case at another project similarly situated in Clovis. Commissioner Cunningham sought, and received, assurance that this project would not be targeting Section 8 or low-income residents.

Commissioner Cunningham then asked Senior Planner Ramirez about the apparent lack of response from Clovis Unified School District. Senior Planner Ramirez responded that after distributing the project for comments, staff received a "No Response" from the school district and explained why.

City Planner Araki explained that the school district had stated it no longer needed the Barstow and De Wolf site, and that there are issues with water supply at another proposed site that is still on record. However, an elementary school within the school boundaries of this area will be programmed in within the next couple of years. He assured though, that this area had already been evaluated through the General Plan and the Loma Vista Specific Plan at this high density use, which is why no further studies were performed. City Planner Araki also stated that the State of California has legislation in place that requires cities to look at these as by-right uses, and gave an explanation of what that means in general and for this project in particular, especially in terms of control of conditions.

Senior Planner Ramirez clarified that the gray-hatched areas on the site plan, represented single-story as opposed to single-family as earlier mentioned.

Ms. Comstock provided information about the Ashwood Construction Company aimed at allaying concerns about the company possibly going bankrupt in the near future.

At this point, the Chair closed the public portion.

Commissioner Antuna requested that Associate Civil Engineer Sean Smith provide some information on the traffic issue, as it had been such a prevalent concern. Associate Civil Engineer Smith explained that there have been several traffic studies in the area that indicate the road is operating well within its ultimate level of surface and will do so even in 20 years, even with increased traffic, and that the moments in which traffic will be worse due to school hours will be brief.

City Planner Araki returned to the issue of parks, as it hadn't been addressed yet, giving information from the General Plan and Specific Plan, informing the Commission and public that rather than have one large park, the developer chose to have several mini-parks that in total actually exceed the required park acreage.

Commissioner Cunningham then sought clarification on membership in the landscape maintenance district for this project. City Planner Araki responded that this development will be in the district and it will be per unit.

Senior Planner Ramirez returned to the issue of lighting, assuring that the site plan review process will analyze the paseos, trails, and lights to ensure thematic elements and no imposition on adjacent properties.

Chair Pro Tem Hatcher thanked the member of the public for coming and providing their input. She pointed out that the current process allows more control despite this being a by-right use. She agreed with concerns regarding the school impacts, but remarked that this is being seen everywhere in Clovis Unified School District. She also remarked that while this seems a large increase in units, it isn't in actuality given what they could allowably go up to. Chair Pro Tem Hatcher had no issues voting in favor of this product.

Commissioner Cunningham assured the public that though no development is perfect, they are all moving towards a better community. He expressed appreciation for the developer making changes to mitigate privacy concerns and his concurrence with Chair Pro Tem Hatcher's remarks and position.

Commissioner Antuna also expressed appreciation for the builder's compromises and compliance with most requests they received. She also expressed her appreciation for housing being provided for everyone, and that those who can only afford to rent are not automatically going to be a detriment to the community, iterating her own similar personal experiences.

Commissioner Terrence expressed concurrence with many of his colleagues' comments and his appreciation for this project's attempts to integrate into the neighborhood, as this is not always the case. Though he notes all of the audience's concerns, he approves of this project.

At this point a motion was made by Commissioner Cunningham and seconded by Commissioner Terrence to approve CUP2012-06A. The motion was approved by a vote of 4-0-1.

OLD BUSINESS

None

NEW BUSINESS

None

ADJOURNMENT AT 6:52 P.M. UNTIL the Planning Commission meeting on February 22, 2018.